Emergency Research Status in the Middle Eastern Region

Samah F. Al-Shatnawi¹*; Rawand A. Khasawneh¹

¹ Department of Clinical Pharmacy, Faculty of Pharmacy, Jordan University of Science and Technology, Jordan

ABSTRACT

Conducting research in emergency settings is paramount to advance knowledge and experiences on dealing with critically ill patients. However, the involvement of highly vulnerable subjects, who are mostly incapable of consenting to research participation is challenging. This research paper describes the extent of emergency research and its related ethical issues within emergency settings in the Middle East. A literature review covering several databases was conducted. Several studies conducted within the emergency departments in the Middle Eastern region were located. All studies focused on provision of emergency care, while none described aspects of emergency research. Current literature indicates a dearth of research concerning emergency research settings in developing countries mainly in the Middle Eastern region. Up to the authors' knowledge, this is the first research paper to review the available literature on emergency research should be encouraged and stimulated in the region, in order to improve the effectiveness and safety of healthcare provision to critically ill patients within emergency departments. Adding to that, our findings stimulate the needs for regulatory bodies and regulations that help overcome the main ethical issues surrounding the principle of obtaining informed consents in emergency settings. **Keywords:** Emergency; Research; Middel East; Ethics.

INTRODUCTION

Provision of healthcare in emergency settings should be based on best research evidence to ensure safe, and effective procedures/treatments^[1]. Therefore, conducting research in emergency settings is important to advance knowledge and experiences on dealing and/or treating critically ill patients^[2]. Corresponding to that, a report in 2016 showed that the National Institutes of Health support more studies covering clinical emergency care research^[3]. Emergency settings involve highly vulnerable subjects, who are mostly incapable to provide consent to medical procedures and / or research participation^[4]. Such

*Corresponding author: Samah F. Al-Shatnawi sfshatnawi@just.edu.jo emergent problems mandate immediate actions, where healthcare providers are responsible for assuring the provision of effective and safe interventions^[5]. Given the complexity of situations, it would be highly demanding to obtain informed consents (in a timely manner) from unstable patients or their legal representatives in order to provide them with required interventions such as Cardio-Pulmonary-Resuscitation (CPR)^[6]. As a result, such situations represent a substantial ethical challenge to healthcare providers and researchers who basically deal with emergency cases^[7].

Worldwide, since the mid of 70's and according to the Belmont report, researchers and healthcare practitioners must respect the utmost importance of subject's autonomy "respect for the patient's capacity of self-determination, and exercise of personal choice, "^[8]represented by the

Received on 14/5/2021 and Accepted for Publication on 28/11/2021.

principle of informed consent^[9]. However, the problematic situation with emergency research originates from the fact that it is not always possible to obtain informed consents from patients who are unconscious, unable to communicate with healthcare providers or researchers, or undergoing tremendous physical and/or psychological stress ^[2, 10]. Because outcomes in emergency settings depend mainly on the earliest provided intervention, any delay (even short) to obtain consent (including proxy consent) may cause mortality or loss of survival chances^[11]. In accordance to that the Federal Drug Administration^[12] established a policy in 1996 "Exception from Informed Consent (EFIC)" as an attempt to balance between human right of "Autonomy" and the progress of medical practices and research in emergency settings^[13]. In addition to that the FDA still mandates several protective measures to emphasize on patients autonomy^[14]. First of all, FDA articulates conditions for applying EFIC policy. Such conditions include unexpected case scenarios with life threatening conditions, such as dealing with debilitated or incapacitated patients, lack of proven or satisfactory treatment options, availability of interventions that might achieve direct benefit to the health of patients, feasibility of offering treatments on timely manner (prior to obtaining proxy consent from legally authorized representatives), and community consultation. Such requirements, however, remains unclear and poorly defined to both emergency healthcare practitioners and researchers. Studies have revealed high levels of frustration among emergency researchers within some settings, where physicians have a full power to prescribe, even without an ethical approval, pharmaceuticals that have not been scientifically approved effective and safe for certain medical conditions ^[7, 15, 16].

Besides researchers' and healthcare providers' opinion about waiving informed consent in emergency settings, many studies have shown that public's opinion and acceptance to this principle is vague. There is no clear answer to the question of as to whether available regulations that allow for waiving informed consent in emergency settings could protect public health and human rights ^[17]. Worldwide, it is highly recommended to educate populations about medical research within different settings and the importance of public involvement in research. Shedding light on factors that can influence and / or hinder public trust in medical research especially in research without consent is highly needed.

Even though emergency departments in developing countries serve very large populations with increased levels of mortality and critical illnesses^[18, 19], little or no regulations and rules that demarcate emergency practices and research principles are available. As an example, the Jordanian Clinical Research Law of 2001, covers none regarding emergency research and its ethical related issues ^[20, 21]. This research paper aimed to review research examining emergency research and challenging ethical issues in emergency situations within developing countries, focusing on Middle East. Application of different ethical rules and regulations permitting research of this kind within this region was the main focus of the current search.

Research Methods

Several databases were searched (September 2020 -February 2021): PubMed, Web of Science, Medline, PsychInfo, Web of Knowledge, and CINAHL. The search terms are listed in Table 1. Research papers were located and individually reviewed by both researchers. Suitability of research papers to be included was based on detailed discussions and agreement between researchers. Final agreement was to locate all peer reviewed papers covering any topic related to emergency medicine and/or research within the Middle Eastern region. References lists of located papers were searched to identify relevant papers. Only articles pertaining to issues of conducting emergency research in developing countries mainly within the Middle Eastern region were included. Research papers published in languages other than English were excluded.

Table 1	1:	Search	Terms
---------	----	--------	-------

Emergency research OR	AND	Ethical issues OR
Emergency medicine		Informed consent OR
		Emergency exception

Results

Considering the wealth of literature on emergency research and its related ethical issues in many developed countries, there was relatively little or no information about emergency research in the Middle East. Using the terms relating to emergency research and ethical issues (Table 1) 639 articles were elicited from all databases collectively. Combining these terms resulted in a total of 41 papers; after reviewing the titles and abstracts two were deemed to be totally unrelated for this review. Among the located studies eight were from Jordan ^[22-29], nine from Turkey^[30-38], one from Yemen [39], five from Egypt^[40-44], three from Iran^[45-47], five from Lebanon^[48-52], six from Saudi Arabia [53-58]and two from United Arab Emirates (UAE) ^[59, 60]. All located studies are summarized below in Table 2.

Since the mid of 90's, research concerning emergency medicine within emergency settings in the Middle East was conducted^[34, 38]. Located studies focused on the development of emergency care specialty and services and

the status of emergency medical care within different institutions^[22, 36, 48]. In addition, several publications have highlighted the characteristics of emergency care visitors, appropriateness of emergency department visits and the level of satisfaction with provided care^[23, 28, 30, 31, 33, 36, 37]. However, none was found on emergency research and ethical issues associated with it. Unfortunately, studies were not designed to investigate emergency research in any depth, but to describe technical aspects of available emergency medicine and offered practices and/or services. It appears as to confront a situation with major ignorance of scientific emergency research and its associated ethical issues within emergency settings in the Middle East.

Despite the fact that, ample research has been conducted within our region to discuss aspects of ethical considerations in different medical departments^[61-64]. None was found covering such considerations within the field of emergency research. Such results reflect the dearth of evidence on conducting emergency research within the Middle Eastern

				0	
Study (year), ref no	Study design	Country	Study setting	Study sample	Main findings
(1995), 38	Descriptive with recommendati ons	Turkey	Descriptive	NA	Emergency medical care in Turkey. Future directions
(1995), 34	Cross- sectional, retrospective	Turkey	ED records over one year, from one hospital	NA	Common causes for admission were infectious, respiratory, and neurological diseases. Infectious diseases were the most common cause of mortality.

 Table 2: Summary of located papers covering issues related to emergency medicine practice and research in the

 Middle-East region

Study (year),	Study design	Country	Study setting	Study sample	Main findings
ref no					
(1996),	Descriptive	Lebanon	Descriptive with	NA	Startup of education and training programs for health care
48	with		recommendations		workers was needed to produce a comprehensive plan for
	recommendati				emergency care in Lebanon.
	ons				
(1997),	Descriptive	Jordan	Descriptive	NA	Efforts were recommended to extend the EMT programs in
22	with				Jordan.
	recommendati				
	ons				
(2000),	Cross-	Jordan	ED records over	2841 patients'	Inappropriate use of emergency services was found to be
24	sectional,		one month, from	records	very common
(2000)	Parene aties	WC A	one nospital	NA	
(2000),	study by	ка			Lack of emergency medicine training programs in the Middle East, so the ED staff is largely experime
50	external ED				Midule East, so the ED start is largery expansion.
	physician				
(2001).	Descriptive	Turkey	Descriptive	NA	Developing international collaboration in the Middle East
36	with		I I I I		region to promote emergency medicine specialist in the
	recommendati				national emergency care system.
	ons				
(2003),	Cross-	Jordan	ED records over 6	29463 patients'	Frequent non-urgent ED visits adversely affect the quality
28	sectional,		months, from one	records	of provided care and patients' satisfaction
	retrospective		hospital		
(2003),	Cross-	Turkey	Hospital-based	1155 patients	High rate of inappropriate ED services usage
33	sectional,		survey in the ED		
	prospective		at one hospital		
			over 2 weeks		
(2004),	Cross-	Turkey	Hospital-based	1113 patients	healthcare providers and the hospital characteristics had the
30	sectional,		survey in the ED		greatest impact on overall satisfaction of ED patients
	prospective		at one hospital		
			over 2 weeks		
(2005),	Cross-	Turkey	Hospital-based	245 patients	Good patient satisfaction was related to high quality care
31	sectional,		survey in the ED		and insurance restrictions, while lengthy waiting time was
	prospective		at one hospital		the main reason of dissatisfaction
			over 6 months		

Emergency Research Status...

Samah F. Al-Shatnawi, Rawand A Khasawneh

Study (year)	Study design	Country	Study setting	Study sample	Main findings
ref no	Study design	Country	Study Setting	brudy sumple	
(2006),	Cross-	Turkey	ED records over 6	3422 patients'	Acute abdomen (bleeding) was the most common reason
37	sectional,		months, from one	records	for emergency surgery
	retrospective		hospital		
(2007),	Cross-	Jordan	ED records over	73259 patients'	Most common causes of ED visits (e.g. chest pain and CVS
23	sectional,		one year, from one	records	disorders, SOB and RS disorders, abdominal pain and GI
	retrospective		hospital		disorders)
(2009),	Cross-	Jordan	Hospital-based	4592 patients	Good patient satisfaction was indicated with some
27	sectional,		survey in the ED		complaints on long waiting time and insufficient staff and
	prospective		at one hospital		beds
			over 2 weeks		
(2009),	Descriptive	UAE	NA	NA	The development of a regional or national program for
59	with				accreditation in emergency medicine will be important
	recommendati				
(2010)	ons			4050	
(2010),	Cross-	Jordan	ED records over	4950 patients	Inappropriate use of emergency services was found very
26	sectional,		one month, from	records	common by non urgent cases.
(2010)	Crease	Tradeca	ED month and a	2070	Number of ED administration and aligned for the second of ED
(2010),	Cross-	Turkey	ED records over 2	2079 patients	Number of ED admissions and crimical features of ED
32	sectional,		hoarital		patients were not different during the month of Ramadan
(2011)	Cross	Iran	Hospital based	500 patients	Efforts on shortening waiting time and improving patients'
47	sectional	Indi	survey in the FD	500 parents	perceptions about waiting in FD as well as improving the
	prospective		at one hospital		overall cleanliness of the emergency room are highly
	prospective		over one week		recommended.
(2012),	Cross-	Turkey	ED records over	21014 patients	Approaching one quarter of ED visits were inappropriate,
35	sectional,		one month, from		where inappropriate use of ED resources was more
	retrospective		one hospital		frequent during specific shifts.
(2013),	Official letter	Jordan	ED records 2006-	Patients' records	Supportive of the involvement of GP and FM in ED
25	with		2011	over 6 years	practice
	recommendati				
	ons				

Study					
(year),	Study design	Country	Study setting	Study sample	Main findings
ref no					
(2013),4	Cross-	Iran	Hospital-based	1104 pediatric	Admission rate increased as the ESI score decreased.
5	sectional,		survey in the ED	patients	
	prospective		at one hospital	ESI tool used by	
	Validation		over 5 months	pediatric trained	
	study			nurses (12) and	
				physicians (4)	
(2013),	Descriptive	Lebanon	Description of	NA	Emergency medical status is related to limited human
50	with		history of		resources, insufficient technical resources, scarce high-
	recommendati		prehospital		level management and system-thinking leadership, and
	ons		emergency care		gaps in public education efforts.
			development with		
			description of		
			existing services.		
(2013),4	Cross-	Iran	ED records over	1923 patients ED	Inappropriate ED visits was associated with evening and
6	sectional,		one month, from	visits	night shifts, payment by health insurance, and the ED visit
	retrospective		one hospital		reason was to obtain rapid treatment
(2013),	Descriptive	Egypt	Descriptive with	NA	Emergency medicine as specialty suffered from unqualified
40	with		recommendations		personnel from other specialities and lacking of resources
	recommendati				
	ons				
(2014),	Cross-	Lebanon	Hospital-based	62 managers	Noninvasive positive pressure ventilation is more
49	sectional,		survey in the ED	and/or directors of	frequently used in EDs in private hospitals.
	prospective		at all ED	ED	
			departments		
			hospital over 6		
			months		
(2014),	Descriptive	UAE	NA	NA	Creation of the Emirates Society of Emergency Medicine,
60	with				the availability of residency training sites, and the
	recommendati				development of fellowship programs, will advance
	ons				emergency medicine specialty
(2014),	Cross-	KSA vs.	Online survey for	73 emergency	The Saudi residents see more patients per hour compared to
57	sectional,	USA	emergency	residents	US peers. Saudi trainees felt less competent in less
	prospective		programs at		common procedures than US trainees. In KSA, compared
			multiple hospitals		to USA, less formal didactics and simulation experience
			in KSA and USA		emergency training was evident.
			over 2 months		

Emergency Research Status...

Samah F. Al-Shatnawi, Rawand A Khasawneh

Study (vear).	Study design	Country	Study setting	Study sample	Main findings
ref no	~~~~, ~~~ <u>8</u> ~		~~~~; ~~~~~g	2 yF	g-
(2015),	Cross-	Jordan	Hospital-based	63 healthcare	Good healthcare providers' satisfaction about the
29	sectional,		survey in the ED	providers	implemented morning report in clinical management of ED
	prospective		at one hospital		cases
			over one year		
(2015),	Cross-	Egypt	Hospital-based	128 Emergency	Nurses working in emergency hospital experienced a
41	sectional,		survey in one	nurses	higher level of different types of workplace violence
	prospective		hospital over one	147 non-	
	~		month	emergency nurses	
(2015),	Cross-	KSA	Hospital-based	10 emergency	The Canadian Emergency Department Triage and Acuity
56	sectional,		case scenario	nurses	Scale has good reliability among emergency department
	Validation		tortiony core contor		
	study		tertiary-care-center		
(2016).	Cross-	Egynt	Hospital-based	266 and 284	About one-quarter of study nurses and physicians suffered
43	sectional	Leypt	survey in the ED	emergency	from high levels of burnout syndrome
	prospective		at one hospital	physicians and	
	Freedom		over 6 months	nurses,	
				respectively	
(2017),	Cross-	KSA	Hospital-based	437548 patient	Low levels of readiness of EDs in academic hospitals to
53	sectional,		interview in ED at	ED visits	manage pediatric patients with critical missing components
	retrospective		6 centers over 5		needed for pediatric emergency care
			months		
(2017),	Cross-	KSA	Hospital-based	250 patients	Rapid emergency medicine score is beneficial for the risk
54	sectional,		survey in the ED		stratification of patients present with chest pain to the EDs.
	prospective		at one hospital		
			over 6 months		
(2017),	Letter to the	KSA	NA	NA	High priority to identify challenges of EMT to allocate
55	editor				available resources with the goal of producing competent,
	~				Saudi-trained EMTs.
(2018),	Cross-	Yemen	Hospital-based	531 healthcare	Insufficient knowledge of Yemeni health professionals
39	sectional,		survey in the ED	providers	regarding emergency and disaster preparedness.
	prospective	1	at one nospital	1	

Study (year), ref no	Study design	Country	Study setting	Study sample	Main findings
(2018),	Cross-	Egypt	Hospital-based	149 patients	Transport time for patients from injury to hospital arrival
42	sectional,		survey in the ED		was around 4 hours, and mean ambulance response time
	prospective		at one hospital		was 45 minutes.
			over 4 months		
(2018),	Cross-	Egypt	Hospital-based	108 emergency	Most of the physicians serviced on average 20-40 patients
44	sectional,		survey in the ED	physicians	per shift, and worked for 40-60 working hours per
	prospective		at one hospital		week. Thus, their Professional quality of life was affected.
			over 3 months		
(2018),	Cross-	Lebanon	ED records over	12,637 pediatric E	Fever of unknown origin, external injuries,
51	sectional,		one year, from one	D visits	upper RS infections, open wounds, and abdominal pain
	retrospective		tertiary-care-center		were the most common reasons for pediatrics ED visits
(2018),	Cross-	Lebanon	ED records over 6	108 patients	ED visits by suicidal attempters were carried out
52	sectional,		years, from one		predominantly at home, on a weekday, and by using
	retrospective				overdose on prescription drugs.
A11					

Abbreviations:

NA: Not applicable or not available; ED: Emergency Department; CVS: Cardiovascular system; SOB: Shortness of breath; RS: Respiratory system; GI: Gastrointestinal; GP: General practitioner; FM: Family medicine; EMT: Emergency medicine training; KSA: Kingdom of Saudi Arabia; US: United States; UAE: United Arab Emirates.

Discussion

Emergency research is essentially important and necessary to enhance and improve public health related outcomes. In the Middle East, emergency settings are crowded by several endemics and outbreaks ^[65]. Therefore, it is important to highlight ethical issues related to emergency research in such setting.

Based on the findings of our literature review, data related to emergency medicine research and ethical governors in MENA region is scarce, and research field in emergency settings is a shady, mysterious area. A potential explanation to this finding is lack of enforced regulations related to emergency research, and disciplinary rules as reported in the review of national research ethics guidelines in Arabic Middle Eastern countries conducted by Alahmad and colleagues ^[39]. There was a lack of regulations related to research ethics in vulnerable persons

except in Egypt and Qatar where this area was covered in local regulations of both countries. In general, local research highlights the needs for more clinical-research and bioethics focused training, which might be initiated by the development and enhancement of educational approaches for healthcare professional students ^[66]. Additionally, the problem of medication shortage ^[67] and low doctor to patient ratio at emergency departments compared to the acceptable ratio as promulgated by WHO, and overcrowded emergency departments in developing countries ^[39] rendering such setting as less favorable environment for research despite its highly dynamic nature and the vast potential for research conduction.

Furthermore, lack of social awareness, false beliefs related to the concept of research, limited research funding, as well as misunderstanding of research-related terms such as informed consent and legal guardian could

Samah F. Al-Shatnawi, Rawand A Khasawneh

Emergency Research Status...

further restrict research in developing countries in general, and in incapacitated emergency departments' patients in particular^[39].

Another confounder related to emergency research is the potential conflict related to legal surrogate in light of the absence of the term (durable power of attorney) in MENA region. This aspect is partially governed by local cultural issues and lack of advance care planning in lowincome MENA countries^[39]. As dictated by cultural beliefs, the role of surrogate is assigned by default to the spouse, older son of the family, or to the older brother based on the depth of familial relationship and inferences.

The strength of the present review lies in covering an important overlooked field that has not been covered by other research conducted in the MENA region. Furthermore, extensive literature review and rigorous search of pertinent studies was followed to prepare this review. As aforementioned, different engines were searched using different search terms. This adds to the reliability of our results. Likewise, it is important to report the possible limitations. Firstly, the limited number of published papers in the scope of emergency research in the MENA region could hinder the accountability of the review. Besides, exclusion of non-English papers is another potential limitation.

The present review is expected to impact the current practices related to emergency research. Reported deficiencies in the area of emergency research should alarm the regulatory authorities to set some rules to better outline research conducted in emergency settings. Additionally, educational campaigns targeting general population should be reinforced to raise awareness level

REFERENCES

- Dickert, N.W., et al., Confronting Ethical and Regulatory Challenges of Emergency Care Research With Conscious Patients. Ann Emerg Med, 2016. 67(4): 538-45.
- 2. CRASHTrialManagementGroup, *Research in emergency* situations: with or without relatives consent. Emerg Med

related to responsible conduct of research, and to stress the importance of research in saving lives of patients and their relatives. Future research assessing population and emergency care providers' perception towards research and related terms, including informed consent is recommended in MENA region to better spot barriers compromising research as perceived by emergency healthcare providers and general population.

Conclusion

The present review highlighted the lack of contemporary data to fully appraise emergency research in the Middle East. Any conducted research in this field is based upon tenuous evidence along vague rules, and this underlines the importance of enforced regulations to protect the welfare of general population and feature scientific emergency services and practices. Noteworthy, Middle Eastern region is geographically close to European countries, which have well-established rules and regulations related to research within emergency settings. As guided by political instability, the Middle East has flooded a significant percentage of refugees to neighboring developed countries, including Europe. The present review highlight the imminent needs to prepare and enact firm rules and regulations better regulate all aspects of medical experiments on human subjects, including emergency research in the Middle East. As a future direction, alignment of consolidated rules and regulations that govern emergency research in the Middle East should improve implemented services and practices within emergency settings in different countries.

J, 2004. 21(6): 703.

- Brown, J., National Institutes of Health Support for Clinical Emergency Care Research, 2011 to 2014. Ann Emerg Med, 2016. 68(2): 164-71.
- 4. Halperin, H., et al., *Recommendations for implementation* of community consultation and public disclosure under

the Food and Drug Administration's "Exception from informed consent requirements for emergency research": a special report from the American Heart Association Emergency Cardiovascular Care Committee and Council on Cardiopulmonary, Perioperative and Critical Care: endorsed by the American College of Emergency Physicians and the Society for Academic Emergency Medicine. Circulation, 2007. 116(16): 1855-63.

- Kaiser, R., Emergency settings: be prepared to vaccinate persons aged 15 and over against measles. J Infect Dis, 2014. 210(12): 1857-9.
- Boulanger, J.M., et al., Canadian Stroke Best Practice Recommendations for Acute Stroke Management: Prehospital, Emergency Department, and Acute Inpatient Stroke Care, 6th Edition, Update 2018. Int J Stroke, 2018: 1747493018786616.
- Foex, B.A., *The problem of informed consent in emergency medicine research*. Emerg Med J, 2001. 18(3): p. 198-204.
- Luce, J.M., *Is the concept of informed consent applicable* to clinical research involving critically ill patients? Crit Care Med, 2003. 31(3 Suppl): S153-60.
- The Belmont Report. Ethical principles and guidelines for the protection of human subjects of research. J Am Coll Dent, 2014. 81(3): 4-13.
- Kompanje, E.J., et al., *Ethical considerations on consent* procedures for emergency research in severe and moderate traumatic brain injury. Acta Neurochir (Wien), 2005. 147(6): 633-9; discussion 639-40.
- Rozynska, J. and M. Czarkowski, *Emergency research without consent under Polish law*. Sci Eng Ethics, 2007. 13(3): 337-50.
- Jordan Food and Drug Administration, J., List of nonprescription medicines approved on 6/5/2018, which are subject to the principles of drug registration and pricing principles, this list will be updated periodically, Medicine, Editor. 2020:

http://www.jfda.jo/Pages/viewpage.aspx?pageID=359.

13. USDepartmentofHealthandHumanServices, Code of

Federal Regulations, Protection of Human Subjects; Informed Consent and Waiver of Informed Consent Requirements in Certain Emergency Research: Final rules 21 CFR Part 50.24 and 45 CFR Part 46.101. Federal Register, 1996. 61(192): 51497-51531.

- USDepartmentofHealthandHumanServices, U.F., Guidance for institutional review boards, clinical investigators, and sponsors: exception from informed consent requirements for emergency research, 2013.
- Fost, N., Waived consent for emergency research. Am J Law Med, 1998. 24(2-3): 163-83.
- Margo, C.E., When is surgery research? Towards an operational definition of human research. J Med Ethics, 2001. 27(1): 40-3.
- Lecouturier, J., et al., *Clinical research without consent in adults in the emergency setting: a review of patient and public views.* BMC Med Ethics, 2008. 9: 9.
- Obermeyer, Z., et al., *Emergency care in 59 low- and middle-income countries: a systematic review*. Bull World Health Organ, 2015. 93(8):577-586.
- Abujaber, S., et al., Developing metrics for emergency care research in low-and middle-income countries. African Journal of Emergency Medicine, 2016. 6(3): 116-124.
- Ramahi, I. and H. Silverman, *Clinical research law in Jordan: an ethical analysis.* Dev World Bioeth, 2009. 9(1): 26-33.
- Alahmad, G., M. Al-Jumah, and K. Dierickx, *Review of national research ethics regulations and guidelines in Middle Eastern Arab countries*. BMC Med Ethics, 2012. 13: 34.
- Abbadi, S., A.K. Abdallah, and C.J. Holliman, *Emergency medicine in Jordan*. Annals of emergency medicine, 1997. 30(3): 319-321.
- 23. Abdallat, A.M. and M.D. Abbadi, *Frequent Attenders To The Emergency Department At Prince Rashed Bin Al-Hassan Hospital.* JRMS, 2007. 14(3): 67-69.
- 24. Abdallat, A.M., I. al-Smadi, and M.D. Abbadi, Who uses

Emergency Research Status...

the emergency room services? East Mediterr Health J, 2000. 6(5-6): 1126-9.

- 25. Halasa, W., *Family medicine in the emergency department, Jordan.* Br J Gen Pract, 2013. 63(614): 462.
- 26. Jerius, M., et al., Inappropriate utilization of emergency medical services at Prince Ali Military Hospital. Journal of the Royal Medical Services, 2010. 17: 32-35.
- Shakhatreh, H. and A. Al-Issa, Patient satisfaction in emergency department at King Hussein medical center. JRMS, 2009. 16(2): 26-30.
- 28. Shakhatreh, H., et al., Use and misuse of accident and emergency services at Queen Alia Military Hospital. Journal of the Royal Medical Services, 2003. 10: 44-47.
- Sabbagh, C., M. Chaddad, and E. El Rassy, *Experience of morning reports in the emergency department*. Intern Med J, 2015. 45(7): 780-3.
- 30. Topacoglu, H., et al., Analysis of factors affecting satisfaction in the emergency department: a survey of 1019 patients. Adv Ther, 2004. 21(6): 380-8.
- Yildirim, C., et al., Patient satisfaction in a university hospital emergency department in Turkey. Acta Medica (Hradec Kralove), 2005. 48(1): 59-62.
- Pekdemir, M., et al., No significant alteration in admissions to emergency departments during Ramadan. J Emerg Med, 2010. 38(2): 253-6.
- 33. Oktay, C., et al., Appropriateness of emergency department visits in a Turkish university hospital. Croat Med J, 2003. 44(5): 585-91.
- 34. Karabocuoglu, M., et al., Analysis of patients admitted to the emergency unit of a university children's hospital in Turkey. Turk J Pediatr, 1995. 37(3): 209-16.
- Eroglu, S.E., et al., Evaluation of non-urgent visits to a busy urban emergency department. Saudi Med J, 2012. 33(9): 967-72.
- 36. Cevik, A.A., U. Rodoplu, and C.J. Holliman, Update on the development of emergency medicine as a specialty in Turkey. Eur J Emerg Med, 2001. 8(2): 123-9.
- 37. Cander, B., et al., *Emergency operation indications in emergency medicine clinic (model of emergency medicine*

Samah F. Al-Shatnawi, Rawand A Khasawneh

in Turkey). Adv Ther, 2006. 23(2): p. 359-63.

- Bresnahan, K.A. and J. Fowler, *Emergency medical care* in *Turkey: current status and future directions*. Ann Emerg Med, 1995. 26(3): p. 357-60.
- Naser, W.N. and H.B. Saleem, Emergency and disaster management training; knowledge and attitude of Yemeni health professionals- a cross-sectional study. BMC Emerg Med, 2018. 18(1): p. 23.
- 40. Montaser, T., Emergency medicine in Egypt: Current situation and future prospects. African Journal of Emergency Medicine, 2013. 3(4): p. S20-S21.
- Abou-ElWafa, H.S., et al., Workplace Violence Against Emergency Versus Non-Emergency Nurses in Mansoura University Hospitals, Egypt. Journal of Interpersonal Violence, 2015. 30(5): p. 857-872.
- 42. Saleh, H.M., et al., Admission delays' magnitude of traumatized patients in the emergency department of a hospital in Egypt: a cross-sectional study. European Journal of Trauma and Emergency Surgery, 2018. 44(2): p. 225-230.
- Abdo, S.A.M., et al., Burnout among physicians and nursing staff working in the emergency hospital of Tanta university, Egypt. Eastern Mediterranean Health Journal, 2015. 21(12): p. 906-915.
- 44. El-Shafei, D.A., et al., Professional quality of life, wellness education, and coping strategies among emergency physicians. Environmental Science and Pollution Research, 2018. 25(9): p. 9040-9050.
- Jafari-Rouhi, A.H., et al., *The Emergency Severity Index,* version 4, for pediatric triage: a reliability study in Tabriz Children's Hospital, Tabriz, Iran. Int J Emerg Med, 2013. 6(1): p. 36.
- 46. Jalili, M., et al., Emergency department nonurgent visits in Iran: prevalence and associated factors. Am J Manag Care, 2013. 19(1): p. e1-8.
- Soleimanpour, H., et al., Emergency department patient satisfaction survey in Imam Reza Hospital, Tabriz, Iran. Int J Emerg Med, 2011. 4: 2.
- 48. Moucharafieh, R. and R. Bu-Haka, Development of

emergency medicine in Lebanon. Annals of emergency medicine, 1996. 28(1): 82-86.

- El-Khatib, M.F., et al., Use of noninvasive positive pressure ventilation in emergency departments of public and private hospitals in Lebanon. Eur J Emerg Med, 2014. 21(3): 230-2.
- 50. El Sayed, M.J. and J.D. Bayram, *Prehospital emergency medical services in Lebanon: overview and prospects.* Prehosp Disaster Med, 2013. 28(2): 163-5.
- 51. El Zahran, T., et al., *The Pediatric Disease Spectrum in an Emergency Department at a Tertiary Care Center in Beirut, Lebanon.* Pediatr Emerg Care, 2018.
- 52. El Majzoub, I., et al., *Characteristics of patients* presenting post-suicide attempt to an Academic Medical *Center Emergency Department in Lebanon.* Ann Gen Psychiatry, 2018. 17: 21.
- 53. Alhajjaj, F.S. and A.S. Aldamigh, Assessment of readiness of academic emergency departments in the central region of Saudi Arabia to receive a sick child. Int J Health Sci (Qassim), 2017. 11(3): 4-8.
- 54. Mehmood, T., M.S. Al Shehrani, and M. Ahmad, Acute coronary syndrome risk prediction of rapid emergency medicine scoring system in acute chest pain. An observational study of patients presenting with chest pain in the emergency department in Central Saudi Arabia. Saudi Med J, 2017. 38(9): 900-904.
- Alamri, Y., Emergency Medical Technician Education in Saudi Arabia: History and Challenges. Prehosp Disaster Med, 2017. 32(6): 699.
- 56. Alquraini, M., E. Awad, and R. Hijazi, *Reliability of Canadian Emergency Department Triage and Acuity Scale (CTAS) in Saudi Arabia.* Int J Emerg Med, 2015. 8(1): 80.
- 57. Alghamdi, K., A. Alburaih, and M.J. Wagner, A Comparison between Emergency Medicine Residency Training Programs in the United States and Saudi Arabia from the Residents' Perception. Emerg Med Int, 2014.

2014: 362624.

- 58. Rhine, D.J., *Emergency medicine in Saudi Arabia: an expatriate's perspective*. Cjem, 2000. 2(2): 125-8.
- Partridge, R., M. Abbo, and A. Virk, *Emergency medicine* in *Dubai*, *UAE*. International journal of emergency medicine, 2009. 2(3): 135-139.
- Fares, S., et al., *Emergency medicine in the United Arab Emirates*. International journal of emergency medicine, 2014. 7(1): 4.
- 61. Moeini, S., M. Shahriari, and M. Shamali, *Ethical* challenges of obtaining informed consent from surgical patients. Nurs Ethics, 2020. 27(2): 527-536.
- 62. Dogan, H.H., et al., Quality and extent of informed consent for invasive procedures: a pilot study at the institutional level in Turkey. Int J Qual Health Care, 2015. 27(1): 46-51.
- 63. Mahafzah, R., K.H. Alzoubi, and O.F. Khabour, *The Attitudes of Relatives of ICU Patients toward Informed Consent for Clinical Research*. Crit Care Res Pract, 2020. 2020: 2760168.
- 64. Joolaee, S., S. Faghanipour, and F. Hajibabaee, *The quality of obtaining surgical informed consent*. Nurs Ethics, 2017. 24(2): 167-176.
- 65. Al Ghobain, M., et al., Perception and Attitude of Emergency Room Resident Physicians toward Middle East Respiratory Syndrome Outbreak. Emerg Med Int, 2017. 2017: 6978256.
- 66. Wazaify M, Nabulsi J, Al-Khateeb W. An Unrecognized Problem? Health Science Students' Awareness of and Attitudes Towards Clinical Research and Bioethics: An Experience from Jordan*Jordan Journal of Pharmaceutical Sciences*. 2012, 5(2): 101-110. University of Jordan.
- 67. Alefan Q, Tashman K, Mukattash T, Alazzam S. Drug shortages in Jordan: a cross-sectional national survey. *Jordan Journal of Pharmaceutical Sciences*. 2016 Jan 1;9.

وضع البحث في حالات الطوارئ في منطقة الشرق الأوسط

سماح الشطناوي 1*، رواند خصاونة 1

¹ قسم الصيدلة السريرية، كلية الصيدلة في جامعة العلوم والتكنولوجيا الأردنية، الأردن.

ملخص

يعد إجراء البحوث العلمية في حالات الطوارئ أمرًا بالغ الأهمية لتعزيز المعرفة والخبرات حول التعامل مع المرضى ذوي الحالات الحرجة والطارئة. ومع ذلك، فإن إشراك هؤلاء المرضى، والذين هم في الغالب غير قادرين على الموافقة والمشاركة في البحث، يمثل تحديًا كبيرا للباحثين ولمزودي الرعاية الصحية. تصف هذه الورقة البحثية الوضع العام للأبحاث في حالات الطوارئ والقضايا الأخلاقية ذات الصلة في منطقة الشرق الأوسط. حيث تم إجراء مراجعة شاملة للعديد من قواعد البيانات وقام الباحثين بتحديد العديد من الدراسات التي أجريت داخل أقسام الطوارئ في منطقة الشرق الأوسط. ركزت جميع الدراسات المنشورة على انماط توفير الرعاية الطارئة، بينما لم يصف أي منها جوانب الأبحاث العلمية في حالات الطوارئ. تشير والم الباحثين بتحديد العديد من الدراسات التي أجريت داخل أقسام الطوارئ في منطقة الشرق الأوسط. ركزت جميع الدراسات الأبحاث العلمية الحالية إلى ندرة الدراسات الم يصف أي منها جوانب الأبحاث العلمية في حالات الطوارئ. تشير والم الباحثين بتحديد العديد من الدراسات المعنية بظروف البحث في حالات الطوارئ في البلدان النامية بشكل عام وفي منطقة الشرق الأوسط بشكل خاص. تعتبر هذه الدراسة الأولى من نوعها لمراجعة الأبحاث المتوفرة حول طبيعة أبحاث الطوارئ في الشرق الأوسط. تشير النتائج المستخلصة من هذه المراجعة إلى أهمية تشجيع وتحفيز المزيد من الجهود التي تركز على أبحاث الطوارئ في المنواق، من أجل تحسين فعالية وسلامة توفير الرعاية الصحية لمرضى الحايت الحرجة داخل أقسام الطوارئ. إضافة إلى ذلك، تعبر نتائج هذه الدراسة عن الحاجة لهيئات ومؤسسات تنظيمية تساعد في التغلب على القضايا الأخلاقية الرئيسية المتعلقة، من أجل تحسين فعالية وسلامة توفير الرعاية الصحية لمرضى الحزيد من الجهود التي تركز على أبحاث الطوارئ في المنطقة، من أجل تحسين فعالية وسلامة توفير الراعاية الصحية المزيد من الحراجة داخل أقسام الطوارئ. إضافة إلى ذلك، تعبر نتائج هذه الدراسة عن الحاجة لهيئات ومؤسسات تنظيمية تساعد في التغلب على القضايا الأخلاقية الرئيسية المتعلقة بمبدأ الحصول على موافقات مستنيرة للمشاركة في الأبحاث المعنية بحالات الطوارئ.

* المؤلف المراسل: سماح شطناوي

<u>sfshatnawi@just.edu.jo</u> تاريخ استلام البحث 2021/5/14 وتاريخ قبوله للنشر 2021/11/28.